

OFFICER REPORT FOR COMMITTEE

DATE: 13th September 2023

P/22/1838/FP
MR. ADRIAN FALCONER

SARISBURY
AGENT: MR. TREVOR AYLES

ERECTION OF ENLARGED REPLACEMENT SINGLE STOREY EXTENSION & ERECTION OF OUTBUILDING. RETENTION OF PORCH.

6 VICTORY COTTAGES, SWANWICK SHORE ROAD, SWANWICK.

Report By

Stephen Appleby – direct dial 01329 824380

1.0 Introduction

1.1 The planning application is reported to the planning committee for a decision due to the number of third-party comments received.

1.2 A separate related application for listed building consent is reported elsewhere on this agenda.

2.0 Site Description

2.1 Number 6 Victory Cottages forms the south-western end of a terrace of Grade II listed late 18th / early 19th former shipwright's cottages. The terrace is constructed in painted brick under a tiled mansard roof and are all of 1½ storeys.

2.2 The row has 13 dormer windows "*hanging*" from the ridge and has the same number of windows with all the cottages each having two windows with the exception of No. 1 which has three. All have centre doors and together the terrace has a regular rhythm and forms an attractive grouping at right angles to Swanwick Hard.

2.3 The buildings are believed to have been built for shipwrights at around the time of Napoleonic Wars or possibly even earlier. The Hard itself, buildings in The Hard, Bay Tree Cottages, the row of Victory Cottages and the former industrial building adjacent to No 1, all form a group. The building is located towards the north-western boundary of the Swanwick Shore Conservation Area which is covered by an Article 4 direction which withdraws certain permitted development rights to enable the Council to retain planning control over proposed changes.

2.4 The building has previously been extended with a conservatory / single storey extension of no particular architectural merit both to the south-western

elevation and to the southern elevation with a small rear extension with a central porch tucked in under the eaves to the rear elevation.

3.0 Description of Proposal

3.1 Planning Permission is sought for the following:

“Erection of enlarged replacement single-storey extension. Installation of rooflights and erection of outbuilding”.

3.2 During the course of the application a number of changes have been made to the originally submitted scheme both to address design concerns and to take on board concerns raised by the neighbours. The changes are outlined below:

- Overall height of the proposed extension reduced from the two-storey timber-gabled extension originally proposed to a more modern designed single-storey extension. Length of single-storey extension reduced both to minimise the impact upon the character of the Grade II listed building and to address concerns regarding turning out of the gravel track onto Swanwick Shore Road.
- Removal of proposed roof lights to rear (*south-east*) roof slope to reduce visual impact and reduce overlooking issues into adjacent properties.
- Inclusion of unconsented rear porch into current scheme to regularise previous works.
- Blocking up of existing kitchen window to reduce overlooking issues.

4.0 Policies

4.1 The following policies apply to this application:

Adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037

D1 – High Quality Design and Place Making

D2 – Ensuring Good Environmental Conditions

HE1 – Historic Environment and Heritage Assets

HE2 – Conservation Areas

HE3 – Listed Buildings and Structures and/or their Settings

TIN 2 – Highway Safety and Road Network

Other Documents:

Fareham Borough Design Guidance: Supplementary Planning Document (excluding Welborne), December 2015

Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy – Swanwick Shore, July 2010

National Legislation and Guidance:

The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990

- Section 66 – Listed Buildings and Setting
- Section 72 – Conservation Areas

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF):

Section 16 – Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment

Historic England Guidance:

Conservation Principles, Policies and Guidance, 2008

Managing Significance in Decision-Taking in the Historic Environment, 2015

The Setting of Heritage Assets (2nd Edition), 2017

5.0 *Relevant Planning History*

5.1 The following planning history is relevant:

FBC.4550	Erection of a Garage
Refuse	28 th April 1957

FBC.4550/2	Erection of a Conservatory
Refuse	28 th March 1973

FBC.4550/3	Erection of a Conservatory
Permission	28 th March 1973

6.0 *Representations*

6.1 Overall eight letters from the notification process have been received regarding this and the related listed building consent application. These relate both to the original submission and following re-notification after amendments to the scheme were made to take into consideration both Historic Environment concerns and concerns raised by the adjoining neighbours.

6.2 One of the letters received supported the proposals, with seven raising objections.

6.3 The areas of concern regarding the proposed development comprise:

- Detrimental to the special architectural and historic interest of the Grade II listed building and the surrounding Conservation Area.
- Loss of privacy and overlooking issues from the proposed skylights in the roof of the southern elevation and from the ground floor kitchen window in the new extension.

- The scheme will block the right turn view for people turning to the right onto Swanwick Shore Road from the gravel track to the rear of Victory Cottages causing a danger to both car drivers and pedestrians.
- The proposed modern design is out of character with the historic character of the listed building, the historic character and group value of the Victory Cottages terrace and the overall character and appearance of the Swanwick Shore Conservation Area.

6.4 Support for proposals comprise:

- Improvement to the character and appearance of the property.

6.5 The above points of concern and support are addressed in the following report.

7.0 Consultations

7.1 No consultations have been undertaken on this application.

8.0 Planning Considerations

8.1 The following matters represent the key material planning considerations which need to be assessed to determine the suitability of the development proposal. The key issues comprise:

- a) High Quality Design;
- b) Impact on Living Conditions;
- c) Highway Safety;
- d) Protecting and Enhancing the Historic Environment;

The statutory test for deciding Listed Buildings and applications affecting Conservation Area are defined in Section 66 and Section 72 the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

- Section 66 (Listed Buildings) – *“In considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.”*
- Section 72 (Conservation Areas) – *“With respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area.”*

8.2 The following conclusion and advice was offered to the applicant at the pre-application stage:

“The proposed extension effectively doubles the size of the existing property and makes no attempt to be subservient to the existing listed building, doubling the width of the existing facade. This will have a negative effect on the special architectural and historic interest of the building.”

“The existing building forms part of a listed terrace of small former shipwright’s cottages that have a regular rhythm, uniformity and scale. An important part of the character of the listed terrace is in the uniformity and existing spatial characteristics of the cottages which would be compromised by the current proposals.”

“The proposed glazed gable end and rooflights to the south-east roof slope will also introduce visually incongruous elements that will also detract from the historic character of the terrace.”

“The building has previously been extended with unsympathetic single storey extensions both to the south-western and south-eastern elevations. These are not particularly attractive and do not contribute either to the character of the building or to the Conservation Area. The replacement of the existing extensions with something more in-keeping with the building and the Conservation Area would be acceptable”

“A simple single storey extension, possibly joining the side and rear extensions together to create more internal space, in an architectural style that complimented and contrasted with the historic core of the building would be acceptable depending on the final design and materials, but this would need be single storey to remain subservient to the existing building.”

“The summer house should be possible although this will have to be a small-scale structure that complements the setting of the listed building and the character of the Conservation Area.”

a) High Quality Design:

8.2 Policy D1 of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037 seeks to ensure that development proposals and spaces will be of a high quality, based on the principles of urban design and sustainability to ensure the creation of well designed, beautiful and safe quality places. The Policy continues to confirm that development proposals will be permitted where they respond positively to elements of local character, ecology, history, and culture and heritage.

- 8.3 The current applications propose the removal of an inappropriate flat roofed side extension / conservatory that was added to the south-western end of the row of Victory Cottages in 1973. This was permitted three years before the building was listed in 1976. The existing extension is constructed in stretcher bond brickwork painted white to try and blend in with the historic building. It has a plain white soffit topped by flat bitumen felt roof and UPVC windows all around. There is also a previously unconsented porch to the rear (*south-eastern*) elevation of the building. Neither the existing extension or unconsented rear porch have any particular architectural merit either in terms of design or materials.
- 8.4 The Council's adopted Design Guidance seeks to ensure that all development responds positively to and is respectful of the key characteristics of the area and any existing heritage assets, either designated or non-designated.
- 8.5 Following discussions during the determination period of the application changes have been made to the proposals:
- Overall height of the proposed extension reduced from the two-storey timber-gabled extension originally proposed to a more modern designed single-storey extension Length of single-storey extension reduced both to reduce the impact on character of the Grade II listed building and to address concerns regarding turning out of the gravel track onto Swanwick Shore Lane.
 - Removal of proposed roof lights to rear (*south-east*) roof slope to reduce visual impact and reduce overlooking issues into adjacent properties.
 - Inclusion of unconsented rear porch into current scheme to regularise previous works.
 - Blocking up of existing kitchen window to reduce overlooking issues.
- 8.6 As outlined above, the existing extension has no particular architectural or heritage value and currently detracts from the special architectural and historic interest of the building. Any proposals that remove the current extension and replace it with something of a better quality in terms of design and materials while still respecting the character of the building and the Conservation Area is considered a net gain in design terms, however marginal, and will comply with adopted Design Guidance.
- 8.7 In this respect and taking into consideration the siting, materials, scale and colour of the proposed extension and comparing it against what is already existing, it is considered that there would be a marginal gain in design terms. The proposals are considered to respond positively and respectfully to the key characteristics of the area and as such accords with the objectives of Policy D1 of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037.

b) Impact on Living Conditions:

- 8.8 Policy D2 of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037 has regard to ensuring development provides good environmental conditions. It continues to highlight that development proposals will be permitted where they do not have an unacceptable adverse impact on the environmental conditions of future occupiers and users or on adjacent/nearby occupants and users through ensuring appropriate outlook and ventilation and providing adequate daylight, sunlight and privacy.
- 8.9 A number of concerns have been raised by the local residents with regard to the impact of the proposed scheme on living conditions. This includes overlooking and loss of privacy
- 8.10 With regard to the overlooking issues and associated loss of privacy, one of the issues raised was that the proposed rooflights on the main rear (*south-eastern*) roof slope would look into the bedroom windows of The Hard Cottage opposite. Amendments were subsequently requested from the agent on both this and other design issues as the rooflights were considered to be unacceptable. These were subsequently removed from the scheme, leaving just the rear window in the new extension facing The Hard Cottage. The one remaining window in the south-east elevation is located directly opposite a blank brick wall so does not directly face into the window of The Hard Cottage. The other remaining (*existing*) window in the rear elevation closest to the window of The Hard Cottage is to be in-filled which will further reduce any potential overlooking and privacy issues.
- 8.11 Following the changes made to the scheme during the consultation process it is considered that the proposals will not have an adverse effect on the living conditions of neighbouring residents, in accordance with Policy D2 of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037.

c) Highway Safety

- 8.12 One further issue raised by neighbours is potential problems with sightlines when turning right out of the gravel track between Victory Cottages and Bay Tree Cottages. Concerns have been raised that as the proposed south-west wall of the new extension is going to be level with the end of the green control / monitoring box on the junction of the gravel track and Swanwick Shore Road, that turning right would be problematic due to the reduced sightlines.
- 8.13 Due to design issues, the width of the proposed extension has now been scaled-back to reduce the bulk and massing and to make it more subservient to the listed building. Effectively this brings the south-western wall in to around the north-east edge of the control box leaving enough space between

the new extension and the boundary fence to see along Swanwick Shore Road when turning out of the gravel track.

- 8.14 Traffic speeds along Swanwick Shore Road are also very low due to the narrow nature of the road, and therefore given the slow traffic speeds, and acceptable sightlines it is considered unlikely that the proposals would result in a highway safety concern, in accordance with Policy TIN2 of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037.

d) Protecting and Enhancing the Historic Environment:

- 8.15 In considering the impact of the proposed works, great weight is given to the conservation of both designated and non-designated heritage assets. Policy HE3 of the Fareham Local Plan 2037 and Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Area) Act, 1990 set out that when considering planning applications for development which affects a listed building or its setting the Local Planning shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 8.16 Policy HE2 of the Fareham Local Plan 2037 and Section 72 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Area) Act, 1990 set out with respect to any buildings or other land in a Conservation Area, special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of that area. Harm or loss will require clear and convincing justification in accordance with the advice in the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). In this respect, Paragraph 206 of the NPPF requires that new development within the setting of a heritage asset(s), should look for opportunities to preserve, enhance or better reveal the significance of the heritage asset(s).
- 8.17 The key characteristics of the area surrounding 6 Victory Cottages are defined in the Swanwick Shore Conservation Area Appraisal (2010) which was designated in 1994. *“Swanwick Shore occupies a bend on the eastern side of the River Hamble. The conservation area comprises the group of buildings, public hard and river frontage that form the village settlement at Lower Swanwick. The hard and river frontage are situated close to the Bursledon Bridge on low lying ground to the south of Bridge Road.”*
- 8.18 In the context of the Conservation Area, 6 Victory Cottages is located right on the north-western boundary on the corner of Swanwick Shore Road. Number 6 Victory Cottages forms the south-western end of a terrace of Grade II listed late 18th / early 19th former shipwright’s cottages.

- 8.19 The contribution the terrace of Victory Cottages makes to the overall character of the Conservation Area is in its location, built form and its historic significance. The terrace forms an attractive grouping and defines the north-western boundary of the Conservation Area.
- 8.20 The building has previously been extended with a single storey extension with no particular architectural merit both to the south-western elevation and with a small rear extension with a central porch tucked in under the eaves to the rear (*south-east*) elevation. Looking at the planning history for the building the existing porch was constructed without planning permission and is currently unconsented.
- 8.21 The proposed extension has been discussed extensively during and in advance of the submission of the current applications. Originally at the pre-application stage it was proposed to extend the existing south-west gable end of the building to create a two-storey timber-framed extension. This was considered unacceptable as it made no attempt to be subservient to the relatively small proportions of the host listed building. The advice given at the pre-application stage (*outlined above*) was that a reduced single-storey extension replacing the inappropriate 1973 conservatory would be acceptable in Historic Environment policy terms as long as this was of better-quality design and constructed in better quality materials.
- 8.22 When the current applications were originally submitted the proposed design was still for a two-storey extension, despite the previous pre-application advice. During the notification period, due to design concerns and issues raised by neighbours, various amendments were made to the scheme. Although larger than the existing conservatory, the proposal is now considered to be a marginal improvement on the existing and, therefore, acceptable in Historic Environment policy terms.
- 8.23 The proposed summer house will be a small timber building of traditional construction and materials and is consistent with other outbuildings in the vicinity. This is also considered to be acceptable in Historic Environment policy terms.
- 8.24 In summary, the revised proposals are considered to be acceptable in Historic Environment policy terms. Although marginal, the gain in terms of the removal of the inappropriate 1973 extension and its replacement with a slightly larger single-storey extension of better-quality design and materials is now considered to accord with Section 66 & Section 72 of the 1990 Act and the relevant policies of the adopted Fareham Local Plan 2037, subject to the approval of materials. In context of the contribution 6 Victory Cottages makes to the overall character of the Swanwick Shore Conservation Area, the Grade

It listed building is in a very prominent position and the current proposals will marginally enhance both the special architectural and historic interest of the building and the overall character of the Conservation Area.

9.0 Recommendation

9.1 GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION, subject to the following Conditions:

1. The development shall begin within three years from the date of this decision.
REASON: To allow a reasonable time period for work to start, in accordance with section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, and to enable the Council to review the position if a fresh application is made after that time.
2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved documents:
 - a) Extension to 6 Victory Cottages, Swanwick Shore Road, Swanwick, Fareham – Plans and Elevations (Existing) – Dwg No: - 1511/01.
 - b) Extension to 6 Victory Cottages, Swanwick Shore Road, Swanwick, Fareham – Plans and Elevations (Proposed) – Dwg No: - 1511/02 Rev. D.
 - c) 6 Victory Cottages, Swanwick Shore Road, Swanwick, Fareham – Design and Access Statement. – Ref: - 1511.

REASON: To avoid any doubt over what has been permitted.

3. External Materials - No works shall take place until the applicant has provided the following details and the specifications have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority:
 - Roofing materials including product details, sample, detailing and method of fixing.
 - All windows including sections, mouldings, profiles and paint colour. Sections through casements, frames and glazing bars should be at a scale of 1:2 or 1:5.
 - Any external vents, flues and meter boxes.
 - Details of all brickwork, including product details, sample and type of pointing.
 - Type and details of external finishes including colour, proportions of mix, method of application and finishes.
 - New rainwater goods including profiles, materials and finishes.

The approved shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. Any deviation from the approved details shall be approved in writing by the local planning authority.

REASON – To ensure the works protect the special architectural and historic interest of the building and the character of the Conservation Area.

THEN

9.2 **DELEGATE** authority to the Head of Development Management to make any necessary modification, deletion or addition to the proposed conditions.

10.0 Background Papers

10.1 Application documents and all consultation responses and representations received as listed on the Council's website under the application reference numbers, **P/22/1838/FP**.

FAREHAM

BOROUGH COUNCIL



6 Victory Cottages
Swanwick Shore Road, Fareham
Scale 1:1,250



© Crown copyright and database rights 2023 OS AC0000814042. You are permitted to use this data solely to enable you to respond to, or interact with, the organisation that provided you with the data. You are not permitted to copy, sub-licence, distribute or sell any of this data to third parties in any form.